



LEGISTICS SECTIONS AND AND ASSESSMENT SECTION OF SECTIO

MICROCOPY RESOLUTION TEST CHA NATIONAL MUREAU DE STANDARDS 1965



# THE FILE COPY

# Changing the Layers of Mind

Technical Report PCG-12

# Kurt VanLehn

Departments of Psychology and Computer Science Carnegie Mellon University Pittsburgh, PA 15213 U.S.A.

2 July 1987

# DEPARTMENT of PSYCHOLOGY





Approved for public releases

Distribution Unlimited

Carnegie-Mellon University

87 10 13 028



# **Changing the Layers of Mind**

Technical Report PCG-12

### Kurt VanLehn

Departments of Psychology and Computer Science Carnegie Mellon University Pittsburgh, PA 15213 U.S.A.

2 July 1987

Running Head: The Layers of Mind



This research was supported by the Personnel and Training Research Programs, Psychological Sciences Division, Office of the Naval Research, under Contract No. N00014-86-K-0678. Reproduction in whole or in part is permitted for any purpose of the United States Government. Approved for public release; distribution unlimited.

Unclassified  ECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE  REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE  .					
2a. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION AUTHORITY	3 DISTRIBUTION/AVAILABILITY OF REPORT				
2b. DECLASSIFICATION / DOWNGRADING SCHEDULE	Approved for public release; Distribution unlimited				
4. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER(S)	5. MONITORING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER(S)				
PCG-12	Same as Performing Organization				
6a. NAME OF PERFORMING ORGANIZATION 6b. OFFICE SYMBOL (If applicable)	7a NAME OF MONITORING ORGANIZATION Personnel and Training Research				
Carnegie-Mellon University	Office of Naval Research (Code 1142 PT)  7b ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)				
6c. ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)  Department of Psychology Pittsburgh, PA 15213	800 N. Quincy St. Arlington, VA 22217-5000				
8a. NAME OF FUNDING/SPONSORING ORGANIZATION Same as Monitoring Organization  8b OFFICE SYMBOL (If applicable)	9 PROCUREMENT INSTRUMENT IDENTIFICATION NUMBER N00014-86-K-0349				
8c. ADDRESS (City, State, and ZIP Code)	10 SOURCE OF FUNDING NUMBERSp40005ub201/7-4-86				
	PROGRAM PROJECT TASK WORK UNIT NO NO N/A N/A N/A N/A				
11 TITLE (Include Security Classification) Changing the layers of mind					
12 PERSONAL AUTHOR(S)					
Kurt VanLehn					
13a TYPE OF REPORT 13b TIME COVERED FROM 86Jun15 TO870ct31	14 DATE OF REPORT (Year, Month, Day) 15. PAGE COUNT 87 July 2				
16 SUPPLEMENTARY NOTATION	0, 341, 2				
'7 COSATI CODES '8 SUBJECT TERMS	(Continue on reverse if necessary and identify by block number)				
FELD GROUP SUB-GROUP Cognitive a of training	tive architectures, cognitive psychology, transfer				
19 ABSTRACT Continue on reverse if necessary and identify by block	number)				
See re	everse side.				
20 DISTRIBUT ON AVAILABILITY OF ABSTRACT	21 ABSTRACT SECURITY CLASSIFICATION				
UNCLASSIFIED/UNLIMITED SAME AS RPT DTC SERS	22b TELEPHONE (Include Area Code) 22c OFFICE SYMBOL				
Susan Chipman  DD FORM 1473,84 MAR  83 APR edition may be used u					

All other editions are obsolete

Unclassified

# **Abstract**

It is common in cognitive science to assume that the mind is composed of layers of programmable machines. The machine of the top layer runs the end user program which, roughly speaking, performs the task at hand. Every other machine runs a program that implements the memories and primitive processes of the machine above it in the stack of layers. The bottom machine is actual neuronal hardware." A natural part of the layering principle in computer systems design is that the layers can be changed. In particular, any layer, except the hardware layer, can be replaced without changing the others.

This essay examines the psychological implications of the hypothesis that layers can be changed.

43. P



ACCMOID!	For		
NTIS ( 0 to 1 0 to 1 0 to 1	AB Salad		
13g 13 + 150	1.201	- an	
Δ,	alliadry i	Corios	
	B. A. Ser Species	, -	<b></b> · ·
A-1	: :		

#### 1. Introduction

2000 B 2000 C 20

SANCES RESERVED DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPERTY OF

One can argue that good principles of design for electronic computing systems may also be good principles for neuronal computing systems. Fodor (1975) argues that the mind is a stored program computing system where the programs are learned and the hardware is innately specified. Simon (1969) argues that mental functions must be nearly decomposable and hierarchically arranged. Fodor (1983) argues that the mind is modular, with one module for language, another for imagery, etc. All three hypotheses--programability, hierarchy, and modularily -- are supported by empirical tests, or at least, they could be. The mere analogy to computing systems is not by itself a convincing argument for a psychological principle, although it is suggestive.

Recently, it has become common to assume that a further principle of computing systems is obeyed by the mind. The *layering hypothesis* is that the mind consists of layers of programmable machines. Each machine consists of memories and primitive processes, the operation of which is controlled by the program running on that machine. The machine of the top layer runs the "end user" program which, roughly speaking, performs the task at hand. Every other machine runs a program that implements the memories and primitive processes of the machine above it in the stack of layers. The bottom machine is actual neuronal "hardware." Perhaps connection systems are low in the stack, close to the neuronal layer but not identical to it. Further up the stack are, perhaps, spreading activation or marker-passing systems that employ "localist" or symbolic endings. On the top might be a general problem solving architecture, such as SOAR (Laird, Rosenbloom, & Newell, 1986) or a special purpose architecture for, e.g., processing language.

Although this picture of the mind is not new, a closer examiniation of it reveals that it is incomplete. A natural part of the layering principle in computer systems design is that the layers can be changed. In particular, any layer, except the hardware layer, can be replaced without changing the others. This essay examines the implications of the hypothesis that layers can be changed. In the first section, the computer science rationale for changeable layering is presented. In section two, these implications are extended via the usual analogy of minds and computers.

What is missing from this brief speculative essay is a proper defense of the changable-layers hypothesis. In other work of this kind (e.g., Fodor, 1983; Fodor, 1975; Simon, 1969), hypotheses are supported by showing how they simplify the accounts of numerous psychological phenomena. No such support is ventured here. So what we have here is pure speculation, although its relevance to contemporary debates in cognitive science makes it germane and perhaps even interesting.

# 2. Layers of Virtual Artificial Machines

It is standard to implement complex electronic computing systems in layers. The bottom layer is the machine's hardware. It usually consists of several types of memory with different capacities and decay rates. There are multiple data pathways and multiple special-purpose processors, often with different timing characteristics. There are usually several clocks and myriads of gates (controlled switches) available to regulate the flowing data. Orchestrating this parallel maze of processing is a program, written in a special language called the "microcode." It is designed to execute another program that is written in a language called the "macrocode." The macrocode program operates on the assumption that there is just one processor, and one (or a few) memories. The microcode program makes this assumption valid. It implements a *virtual* processor and memories, or a *virtual machine* as it is standardly called. The virtual machine is much simpler than the real machine. Moreover, it is designed to be the kind of simplicity that enables simple macrocode programs to perform complex tasks.

On many computers, there are several layers of virtual machines. The lowest layers are written by the computer's manufacturer and come as part of the machine. The middle layers are usually an operating system, such as Unix, and on top of that, an interpreter for a programming language such as LISP or LOTUS 1-2-3. The user's program might itself implement another VM. For instance, a user's C program might implement a LISP interpreter, and the LISP program might implement an interpreter for a production system.

The layering of virtual machines is a good design principle because it permits very complicated tasks to be achieved with layers of simple programs. The programs that implement VMs, which are called *interpreters*, all have a similar structure. They are a single giant loop that runs endlessly. Inside the loop, the most important task is to fetch the next instruction in the macro program (the one being interpreted), then call the subroutines that implement that type of instruction. In addition, the loop may have some general housekeeping tasks that must be done constantly, such as managing memory or checking the state of peripheral devices.

Interpreters are conceptually simple because they are modular. Each type of instruction in the macro language corresponds to one module in the interpreter. The modules are written so that macro instructions can be implemented in *any order*. This independence of order is the key to allowing complex tasks to be simply programmed in the macro language. The program writer does not need to worry about fine-grained interactions among the macro instructions, because there are guaranteed to be none. This leaves the programmer free to consider only large-grained interactions--those that are intended to occur.

A second important feature of layering is that it allows changing virtual machines. Typically, there are only two useful applications of this ability:

- Changing the bottom layers and leaving the top. This is useful when the same user programs need to be run on different hardware. For instance, many different hardware manufactures provide appropriate lower layers for interpreting the UNIX operating system. This allows UNIX programs written on other machines to be executed on theirs.
- Changing the top layers and leaving the bottom. This is useful when the same hardware is needed for different applications. For instance, one application might be best handled with a program written in LISP, while another application program is better suited for implementation in Prolog. By changing the top few layers, one can change a LISP virtual machine into a Prolog virtual machine.

# 3. Layers of Virtual Mental Machines

THE STATE OF THE PROPERTY OF THE SECRECATION OF THE

If the mind is like a computer, then good design principles for computers should be good design principles for minds. The preceding section described one good design principle, the layering of VMs. Assuming that Nature has designed our the minds well, the mind too should have layers of VM, and moreover, some of those layers should be changeable. The analogy between layered computers and layered minds is quite direct. Electronic hardware corresponds to neuronal tissue. The next layer up might be appropriately modelled by a connection system of the distributed kind. The next level up might be a localist connection system. Perhaps several layers higher, the mind has several VMs--perhaps a VM something like Berwick's (1985) Lparisfal for language, a VM like Kosslyn's (19) screen for imagery, and a VM like SOAR (Laird, Rosenbloom, & Newell, 1986) for general problem solving.

This view of the mind may not be particulary startling. I think that most cognitive scientists already believe the mind is organized as multiple layers. Indeed, there have been several investigations of how a program written for a connection system can implement a serial, von Newman-style VM (see, e.g. Rumelhart, Smolensky, McClelland and Hinton, 1986).

However, a tacit assumption of the layered view of mind is that the mind consists of a single, unchanging stack of virtual machines, from neurons on up to e.g., a production system. But this static view of the layers of mind implies that one of the biggest advantages of electronic VM layers is not utilized by the mind--the ability to change layers. It seems much more plausible that the mind can swap VMs, and does so whenever it is useful.

Just as in computing systems, there may be two kinds of utility: changing the top layers and changing the bottom layers. Changing the top layers is useful when a person's task changes. The mind

might swap in Kosslyn's machine while doing an imagery task, and Newell's machine while doing a problem solving task. Changing the bottom layers is useful when the memory resources available for a task change. This latter ability might seem rather useless, since it is a safe assumption that the internal memory resources (e.g., short-term memory, long-term memory) change very slowly, if it all. However, if lower VM are in charge of utilizing external memory resources, such as a piece of scratch paper or a blackboard, then memory resources can change rapidly, so the ability to switch the lower VM layers might in fact be useful.

Indeed, it seems possible to use this notion of changing the external memory resources as test of the changeable layers hypothesis. Suppose that the mind uses one lower VM for mental arithmetic and another for regular written arithmetic. There is a second, higher VM for executing the arithmetic algorithm. The lower VM implements the algorithm's primitives (e.g., "what digits are in the hundreds column?"). These assumptions predict that if a subject learns to do both addition and subtraction on paper, then learns how to do mental addition, the subject can immediately do mental subtraction. This massive transfer is caused by swapping out the VM for writing and swapping in the VM for mental." "writing", which was learned with the addition program. If VM cannot be swapped, then the three learning episodes generate three program/primitive combinations. To master mental subtraction would require learning a new program/primitive combination. Such static, unchanging VM layers predict less than immediate transfer.

Unfortunately, the situation is not nearly so simple. Current theories of transfer (Kieras & Bovair, 1985, Singley & Anderson, ress) hold that the amount of transfer is proportional to the number of productions shared between the old procedure and the new procedure, and transfer is measured by saving in learning time. In these studies, there is only one old procedure, and it does not completely overlap the new procedure. Consequently, some productions in the new procedure must be learned afresh rather than being transferred from the old procedure. In the hypothetical experiment under discussion, there are two old procedures, a written subtraction procedure and a mental addition procedure. If these procedures are represented as homogeneous sets of productions, then the new procedure would be constructed by taking half its productions from each of the two old procedures. This would predict a complete savings in learning, which would be consistent with the expected result that mental subtraction could be acquired immediately. Thus, the prediction of massive transfer can be obtained without swapping layers.

However, this unchangable-layers account for the putatively massive transfer breaks down when analyzed more closely. Transfer is a form of analogy, and in all current theories of analogy, there is some search involved in finding appropriate old knowledge that can be used as the source of the analogy. To perform the transfer in this hypothetical experiment, the search would have to decide which productions to get from the written subtraction procedure and which to get from the mental addition procedure. If this search takes any resources at all, transfer would be less than immediate. However, the search would become trivial (and hence consistent with the expected experimental findings) if the production sets for the old procedures were divided by a boundary line, so that productions below the line dealt with the medium for storage (i.e., the paper or the mind) and the productions above the line dealt with the arithmetic algorithm. This is just exactly the layering hypothesis, instantiated in a production system formalism.

In summary, the empirical discrimination between the hypotheses of layered versus unlayered production sets rests on finding out just exactly how immediate the transfer is in the experiment under discussion. If it is virtually instantaneous, then the layering hypothesis is supported. So the situation is actually an empirically delicate one.

# 4. Summary

THE STATES OF SECRETARY PRODUCED FOR SECURIOR DESCRIPTION OF SECRETARY PRODUCED AND SECURITIES ASSESSED FOR SECURITIES.

This essay has assumed, along with much of the cognitive science community, that the mind consists of layers of virtual machines. This assumption is part of the continued tradition of treating the design principles for good computing systems as serious hypotheses about the mind's design.

The point of the essay was to suggest (and only suggest) that *all* of the principle of layered computing systems be taken seriously, and in particular, that the ability to *change* a layer in the stack of virtual machines be considered as a psychological hypothesis. For instance, the top layer might change when the task changes radically, say, from an mental rotation task to a cryptarithmetic task. The bottom layers might change when the memory resources available to the person change.

As shown above, the changable-layers hypothesis does make predictions, especially predictions about transfer, so it is a testable hypothesis. However, it will be a difficult hypothesis to test, as the discussion above indicated.

The layering hypothesis opens up a whole host of issues.

- Where do VM come from? Are they learned?
- What happens while a VM is being swapped? Where does the consciousness (or attention) stand? In a meta-level?
- Does the layering hypothesis allow us to reconcile old controversies, such as the conflict between problem solving architectures, which seem to require arbitrary capacity working memories, and short term memory architectures, with their severe capacity limitations?
- Does compiling from one layer down to the next explain practice effects, such decreasing competition for resources and decreasing cognitive penetrability?
- Does learning a new VM explain how people can recover from some neurological tramas?

My hope is that the mind is much simpler than we ever thought. We only thought it was complex because we tried to model it without using enough layers, which is about as hard as trying to write a Tower of Hanoi problem solver in microcode.

### References

- Berwick, R. (1985). The Acquisition of Syntactic Knowledge. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Fodor, J. A. (1975). The Language of Thought. New York: Crowell.
- Fodor, J. A. (1983). The modularity of mind. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Kieras, D.E. & Bovair, S. (1985). The acquisition of procedures from text: A production-system analysis of trasnfer of training (Tech. Rep. ONR-16). University of Michigan, Dept. of Psychology.
- Laird, J. E., Rosenbloom, P. S., and Newell, A. (1986). Chunking in Soar: The anatomy of a general learning mechanism. *Machine Learning*, 1(1), 11-46.
- Rumelhart, D. E., Smolensky, P., McClelland, J. L., & Hinton, G. E. (1986). Schemata and Sequential Thought Processes in PDP Models. In D. E. Rumelhart & J. L. McClelland (Ed.), Parallel Distributed Processing: Explorations in the Microstructure of Cognition, Vol. 2. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Simon, H.A. (1969). The Sciences of the Artificial. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Singley, K. & Anderson, J.R. (in press). A keystroke analysis of learning and transfer. . Human Computer Interaction, .

University of Minnesota Department of Psychology Phillip L Ackermen Minnespolis. MN

Department of Computer Science Tufts University Medford, MA 02155 Beth Adelson

Naval Training Systems Center Orlando, FL 32813 Numen Fectors Leboratory Robert Ablers Code N711

Nevy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152-6800 Ed Aiken

School of Business Administration Department of Computer and Information Sciences Philedelphia, PA 19122 Temple University Dr Robert Aiken

University of Florida Gainesville, FL 32605 Dr James Algina

Department of Psychology George Mason University 4400 University Drive 22030 John Allen Feirfex, VA

William E. Alley Brooks AFB. TX 78235 AFHRL/MOT

Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Paychology Pittsburgh, PA 15213 Ander son John R

Center for the Study of Reading 174 Children s Research Center Thomas H Anderson Champaign IL 61820 51 Gerty Drive

CAN ASSESSMENT ASSESSMENT OF THE PARTY AND T

Technology & Engineering George Mason University School of Information 4400 University Drive Steve Andriole Foirfex VA

Technical Director, ARI 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333

Medical Research Council Applied Psychology Unit Dr Alan Baddeley Cambridge CB2 2EF 15 Chaucer Road ENGLAND

University of Colorado Department of Psychology Patricia Baggett Boulder, CO 50309 Box 345

UCLA Center for the Study University of California Los Angeles, CA 90024 of Evaluation Eva L Baker 145 Moore Hall

Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego. CA 92152-6800 Meryl S Baker ۵

Dr Isaac Bejar

Educational Testing Service Regulatory Commission United States Nuclear Princeton NJ 08450 Leo Beltracchi Washington DC

20555

Dr Mark H Bickhard University of Texas 58712 EDB 504 ED Psych Austin, TX

525 West 121st Street Columbia University New York, NY 10027 Teachers College Dr. John Black

Naval Training Systems Center Arthur S Blaiwes Orlando, FL 32813 Code N711

Dr. Robert Blanchard Navy Personnel R&D Center Sen Diego, CA 92152-6800

University of Chicago Dr R Darrell Bock 6030 South Ellis Chicago, 1L

University of Pittsburgh Pittsburgh, PA 15260 Learning R&D Center Dr. Jeff Boner

Orlando, FL 32751 Dr Richard Braby NTSC Code 10

Dr Jomills H Braddock II

The Johns Hopkins University Organization of Schools 3505 North Charles Street Center for the Social Baltimore, MD

Naval Training Systems Center Robert Breaux Orlando, FL 32813 Code N-095R

Center for the Study of Reading University of Illinois Champeign. 1L 61280 51 Gerty Drive Dr. Ann Brown

Illinois Institute of Technology 60616-3793 Commending Officer
CAPT Lorin W Brown 3300 S. Federal Street Chicago, 1L NROTC Unit

XEROX Palo Alto Research Dr John S Brown 3333 Coyote Road Center

Palo Alto, CA 94304

The James S McDonnell Dr John Bruer Foundation

University Club Tower, Suite 1610 1034 South Brentwood Blvd Louis, MO

Computer Science Department Stanford University Bruce Buchanan Stenford, CA 94305

20208 Dr Patricia A Buller 555 New Jersey Ave Washington, DC

University of South Carolina Dept of Psychology Columbia, SC 29208 Dr Tom Cafferty

Center for the Study of Reading University of Illinois Dr Joseph C Campione Champaign, 1L 51920 51 Gerly Drive

Center for Research into Practice 1718 Connecticut Ave . N W Washington. DC Joanne Capper

Harvard Graduate School of Cambridge, MA 02138 337 Gutman Library Dr Susan Carey Education Appien Way

		•	
	117	_	
	***	1010	6
-	200	of Psychology	15213
Carpenter	Carnegie-Mellon University	70	<u>د</u>
- C	N-01	Department	Pittsburgh.
=	rai	part	11.00
ā	ŭ	ŏ	Ā,

Dr. John M Carroll
IBM Watson Research Center
User Interface Institute
P O Box 216
Yorktown Meights, NY 10596

LCDM Robert Carter
Office of the Chief
of Naval Operations
OP-01B
Pentagon
Washington, DC 20350-2000

Dr. Alphonse Chapanis 8415 Bellona Lane Suite 210 Buxton Towers Beltimore, MD 21204

Dr. Davida Charney English Department Pena State University University Park, PA 1680 Dr Paul R Chatelier OUSDRE Pentagon Washington, DC 20350-2000

Dr. Michelene Chi Learning R. & D. Center University of Pittsburgh 3939 O'Mara, Street Pittsburgh, PA 15213 Dr. L. J. Chaure Computer Science and Systems Code 7590 Information Technology Division Mayal Research Laboratory Westington, DC 20375

Mr Reymond E Christel AFMRL/MOE Brooks AFE TX 16235

Dr William Clancey Stanford University Knowledge Systems Laboratory 701 Welch Road, Bidg, C Palo Alto, CA 94304

Dr Charles Clifton Tobin Hall Department of Psychology University of Massachusetts

Amherst, MA 01003

Dr Allan M Collins Bolt Beranek & Newman Inc 50 Moulton Street Cambridge, MA 02136 Dr Stanley Collyer Office of Naval Technology Code 222 800 N Quincy Street Arlington, VA 22217-5000

Dr. Lynn A. Cooper Learning R&D Center University of Pittsburgh 3939 O'Hera Street Pittsburgh, PA 15213 LT Judy Crookshanks
Chief of Naval Operations
OP-11265
Weshington, DC 20370-2300

Phil Cunniff
Commanding Officer, Code 7552
Neval Undersea Warfare Engineering
Keyport, WA 98345

Dr. Cary Czichon Intelligent Instructional Colems Texas Instruments Al Leb P.O. Box 660245 Dallas, TX 75266

Brien Delimen 3400 TTW/TTGXS Lowry AFB CO 80230-50

Dr. Matalie Debn
Department of Computer and
Information Science
University of Oregon
Eugene, OR 97403

•

Dr. Gerald F DeJong Artificial Intelligence Group Coordinated Science Laboratory University of illinois Urbana, IL 61801

Goery Delacote
Directeur de L informatique
Scientifique et Technique
CNRS

Peris

75700

Dr Thomas E DeZern Project Engineer, Al General Dynamics PO Box 746 Fort Worth, TX 76101 Dr Andrea di Sessa University of California School of Education Tolman Hall Berkeley, CA. 94720 Dr. R. K. Dismukes Associate Director for Life Sciences AFOSR Bolling AFB Washington, DC 20332

Dr Stephanie Doan Code 6021 Naval Air Development Center Warminster, PA 18974-5000

Defense Technical
Information Center
Cameron Station, Bidg 5
Alexandria, VA 22314
Attn TC
(12 Copies)

Dr Thomas M Duffy Communications Design Center Carnegie-Mellon University Schenley Park Pittsburgh, PA 15213

インマングン

The second second and the second of the second seco

Dr Richard Duran University of California Santa Barbara, CA 93100

Edward E Eddowes
CNATRA N301
Navel Air Station
Corpus Christi, TX 78419

Dr. John Ellis Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92252 University of California.
San Diego
Department of Linguistics C-008
La Jolla, CA 92093

Dr Jeffrey Elmon

Dr. Susan Embretson University of Nansas Psychology Department 426 Fraser Lawrence KS 68045 Dr. Rendy Engle
Department of Psychology
University of South Carolina
Columbia, SC 29208

Dr. William Epstein University of Wisconsin W. J. Brogden Psychology Bldg 1202 W. Johnson Street Madison Wl. 53706

ERIC Facility-Acquisitions
4033 Rugby Avenue
Bethesda, MD 20014

Dr. K. Anders Ericsson University of Colorado Department of Psychology Boulder, CO 60309

Dr. Beatrice J Farr Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333

Dr Mershell J Ferr Ferr-Sight Co 2520 North Vernon Street Artington, VA 22207 Dr Paul Feltovich Southern Illinois University School of Medicine Medical Education Department F O Box 3926 Springfield. IL 62706

Mr Wellace Feurzeig Educational Technology Bolt Beranek & Newmen 10 Moulton St Cambridge, MA 02236 Dr. Gerhard Fischer University of Colorado Department of Computer Science Boulder, CO. 80309

J D Fletcher 9931 Corsica Street Vienna VA 22180 Dr. Linda Flower Gernegie-Meilon University Department of English Pittsburgh, PA 15213 Dr Kenneth D Forbus
University of Illinois
Department of Computer Science
1304 West Springfield Avenue
Urbane. 10. 61801

Dr Berbers A Fox University of Colorado Depertment of Linguistics Boulder, CO 60309 Dr. Carl H. Frederiksen McGill University 3700 McTavish Street Montreal, Quebec H3A 1Y2 CANADA. \$2000 Kanadal Sasaasal saasaa

Or John R Frederiksen Bolt Beranek & Newsen 50 Moulton Street Cambridge, MA 02138 Dr. Michael Genesereth Stanford University Computer Science Department Stanford, CA 94305

Dr Dedre Gentner
University of Illinois
Department of Psychology
803 E Deniel St
Chempaign, 1L 61820

Lee Gladwin Route 3 -- Box 225 Winchester, VA 22601 Dr Robert Glaser
Learning Research
& Development Center
University of Pittsburgh
Pittsburgh. PA 15260

Dr Arthur M Glenberg University of Wisconsin W J Brogden Psychology Bldg 1202 W Johnson Street Madison Wi 53706

Dr. Marvin D. Glock
13 Stone Hall
Cornell University
Ithaca. NY 14053

Dr Sam Glucksberg
Department of Psychology
Princeton University
Princeton, NJ 08540

Dr. Joseph Goguen Computer Science Laboratory SRI International 333 Ravenswood Avenue Menio Park. CA 94025

Dr. Susan Goldman University of California Santa Barbara, CA. 93106

Dr. Depiel Gopher Industrial Engineering & Management TECHNION Haifa 32000

Dr Sherrie Gott AFHRL/MODJ Brooks AFB, TX 78235 Jorden Grafmen, Ph. D. 2021 Lyttonsville Road Silver Spring, MD 2091

Dr. Wayne Grey Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333 Dr. Bert Green Johns Hopkins University Department of Psychology Charles & 34th Street Baltimore, ND 21216 Dr. James G. Greeno University of California Berkeley, CA 94720

Prof Edward Haertel School of Education Stanford University Stanford, CA 94305 Dr. Henry M. Haiff Heiff Resources. Inc. 4918 33rd Road, North Arlington, VA 22207 Janice Mart
Office of the Chief
of Naval Operations
OP-11HD
Department of the Navy
Washington, D C 20350-2000

Mr William Hartung
PEAM Product Manager
Army Research Institute
5001 Eisenhower Avenue
Alexandria, VA 22333

Dr. Wayne Harvey
Center for Learning Technology
Educational Development Center
55 Chapel Street
Newton, MA 02160

Prof John R Mayes Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Psychology Schenley Park Pittsburgh, PA 15213 Dr. Berbara Mayes-Roth
Department of Computer Science
Stanford University
Stanford. CA 95305

Dr. Joan 1 Heller 505 Heddon Road Oakland, CA. 94808 Dr Shelly Heller
Department of Electrical Engineering & Computer Science
George Washington University
Washington DC 20052

Dr. Jim Hollan Intelligent Systems Group Institute for Cognitive Science (C-015)

La Joila CA 92093

OC SD

Or Melissa Moliand
Army Research Institute for the
Behavioral and Social Science

5001 Eisenhower Avenue

Alexandria VA 22333

Ms Julia S Hough Lawrence Erlbaum Associales 6012 Greene Street Philadelphia. PA 19144 Dr James Howard
Dept of Psychology
Human Performance Laboratory
Catholic University of
America

Mashington DC 20064

OPPRINTER FRANKING KOSKONA KOSKONA KOKONANA NODAMAA PRAKAZZZA RZZZZA KEZZZZA

Dr. Earl Hunt Department of Psychology University of Washington Seattle, WA 98105 Dr. Ed Hulchins Intelligent Systems Group Institute for

Cognitive Science (C-015)

La Jolla, CA 92093

Dr. Dillon Incuye WICAT Education Institute Provo, UT 84057

Dr. Alice Isen
Department of Psychology
University of Maryland
Catonswille, MD 21228

Dr R J K Jacob
Computer Science and Systems
Code 7590
Information Technology Division
Warel Research Laboratory
Washington, DC 20375

Dr. Zachary Jacobson
Bureau of Management Consulting
365 Laurier Avence West
Ottowa, Ontario NIA 0S5
CANADA

Dr Robert Jannarone Department of Psychology University of South Carolina Columbia, SC 29208 Dr Ciaude Janvier
Directeur, CIRADE
Universite du Quebec a Montreal
P O Box 0000 St A
CANADA

Dr Robin Jeffries Hewlett-Packard Laboratories P O Box 10490 Palo Alto CA 94303-0973

Margaret Jerome c/o Dr Peter Chandler 63. The Drive Hove

Sussex

•

UNITED KINGDOM

Dr Douglas H Jones

Thatcher Jones Associates

P O Box 6640

10 Trafalgar Court Lawrenceville, NJ Dr. Marcel Just Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Psychology Schenley Park Pittsburgh, Pa 15213

Dr. Ruth Kanfer
University of Minnesota
Department of Psychology
Elliott Hall
75 E. River Road
Minneapolis. MN 55455

Dr. Milton S. Katz Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria VA 22333 Dr. Dennis Kibler University of California Department of Information and Computer Science Irvine, CA 92717 Dr. David Kieras University of Michigan Technical Communication College of Engineering 1223 E. Engineering Building Ann Arbor, MI 48109

Dr Peter Kincaid
Training Analysis
& Evaluation Group
Department of the Navy
Orlando FL 32813

Dr. Paula Kirk Oakridge Associated Universities University Programs Division P.O. Box 117 Oakridge, TN 37831-0117

Dr. David Klahr Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Psychology Schenley Park Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Dr Stephen Kosslyn Harvard University 1236 William James Hall 33 Kirkland St Cambridge, MA 02138 Dr Kenneth Kotovsky Department of Psychology Community College of Allegheny County 800 Allegheny Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15233 Dr. Benjamin Kuipers
University of Texas at Austin
Department of Computer Sciences
T. S. Painter Hall 3.28
Austin, TX 26712

Dr Pat Langley
University of California
Department of Information
and Computer Science
Irvine, CA 92717

M Disne Langston Communications Design Center Carnegie-Mellon University Schenley Park Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Dr Jill Larkin Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Psychology Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Dr. R. W. Lawler ARI 6 S 10 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria VA 22333-5600 STATES TO SECRETARIO DE SESTIMO DE SECRETARIO DE SECRETARI

Dr. Alan M. Lesgold Learning Research and Development Center University of Pittsburgh Pittsburgh, PA. 15260 Dr. Jim Levin Department of Educational Psychology 210 Education Building 1310 South Sixth Street Champaign, IL 61820-6990 Dr. John Levine Learning R&D Center University of Pittsburgh Pittsburgh, PA 15260 Dr Clayton Lewis
University of Colorado
Department of Computer Science
Campus Box 430
Boulder CO 80309

Library Naval War College Newport RI 02940 Library Naval Training Systems Center Oriando FL 32813

Dr Charlotte Linde Structural Semantics P O Box 707

94320

Palo Alto CA

Dr. Marcia C. Linn Lawrence Hall of Science University of California -Berkeley, CA 94720 Dr Frederic M Lord Educational Testing Service Princeton, NJ 08541

Dr. Sandra P. Marshall
Dept. of Psychology
San Diego State University
San Diego. CA 92182

University of California Department of Psychology Richard E Mayer Santa Barbara, CA

Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Paychology Pilisburgh. PA 15213 Jay McCleiland

Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego. CA 92152-6800 Joe McLachian

and Development Center Navy Personnel Research James S McMichael Code 05 ă

Barbare Means

San Diego. CA 92152

Research Organization 1100 South Washington Alexandria, VA 22314 Humen Resources

S Department of Education Washington, DC 20208 Arthur Meimed 724 Brown

Department of Psychology 06540 Princeton University George A Miller Princeton, NJ Green Hell

Echelon Building #1. Suite 231 James R Miller 9430 Research Bivd 9278 Austin TX

Computer Thought Corporation 1721 West Plano Parkway Merk Miller Plens. TX 75075

National Science Foundation Scientific and Engineering Personnel and Education Weshington DC 20550 Dr Andrew R Molnar

San Diego, CA 92152-6800 William Montague NPRDC Code 13

fraining Research Division Alexandrie, VA 22314 1100 S Washington Rendy Musew Program Manager HUMBRRO

1845 S Elena Ave . 4th Floor Redondo Beach A 90277 Behavioral Technology Leboratories - USC Dr Allen Munro

Glasgow Gl 2AD. Scotland 36 North Menover Street The Turing Institute Dr T Niblett UNITED KINGDOM

Institute for Social Research University of Michigan Richard E Nisbett 48109 3 Ann Arbor Room 5261

University of Minnesota

Minneapolis MN

Mary Jo Nissen N218 Elliott Hell

Information Technology Division Computer Science and Systems Navai Research Laboratory Washington DC 20375 A F Norcio Code 7590

La Joilla California 92093 University of California, Institute for Cognitive Science C-015 Doneld A Norman

Director, Training Laboratory San Diego CA 92152-6600 NPRDC (Code 05)

FROM A DECEMBER AND AND AND THE PROPERTY OF TH

Director, Manpower and Personnel San Diego, CA 92152-6800 NPRDC (Code 06) Laboratory.

& Organizational Systems Lab. Sen Diego, CA 92152-6800 Director, Human Factors NPRDC (Code 07)

San Diego, CA 92152-6800 Library, NPRDC Code P201L

Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego. CA 92152-6800 Technical Director

University of Southern California School of Education - WPH 801 Los Angeles, CA 90089-0031 Psychology & Technology Department of Educational Harold F O Neil Jr

Naval Training Systems Center 32013-7100 Michael Oberlin Oriendo FL ة

University of Pittsburgh Learning R & D Center Pillsburgh, PA 15213 Dr Stellen Ohlsson 3939 O Hara Street

Office of Navai Research Director, Research Programs Arlington, VA 22217-5000 800 North Quincy Street

Office of Naval Research Arlington, VA 22217-5000 800 N Quincy Street Code 1133

Office of Neval Research 800 N Quincy Street Arlington, VA 22217-5000 Code 1142PS

Office of Naval Research Arlington. VA 22217-5000 800 N Quincy Street Code 1142CS (6 Copies)

22217-5000 Office of Naval Research. 800 N Quincy Street Arlington, VA Code 11R

Director, Technology Programs Office of Naval Research Arlington, VA 22217-5000 800 North Quincy Street Code 12

22217-5000 Office of Neval Research 800 N Quincy Street Arlington VA Code 125

Office of Naval Research Branch Office. London FPO New York NY 09510 Psychologist Box 39

Special Assistant for Marine Corps Matters. ONR Code DOMC

Artington, 1A 22217-5000

800 N Quincy St

APO San Francisco, CA 96503 Office of Naval Research Liaison Office. Far East Psychologist

Resident Representative Office of Naval Research. UCSD

University of California. 92093-0001 La Joilla. CA San Diego

Assistant for Planning MANTR. Weshington DC 20370 OP 0186

Assistant for MPT Research.
Development and Studies
OP 0187
Washington, DC 20370

Dr Judith Grasanu Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria. VA 22333 CDR R T Pariette
Chief of Neval Operations
OP-112G
Washington, DC 20370-2000

Dr. James Paulson Department of Psychology Portland State University P.O. Box 751 Portland, OR 97207

Dr. Douglas Pearse DCIEM Box 2000 Downsview. Onterio University of California Santa Barbara Department of Psychology Santa Barbara, CA 93106 Dr Virginia E Pendergrass Code 711 Neval Training Systems Center Ortando, FL 32813-7100

Dr. Mancy Pennington University of Chicago Graduate School of Business 1101 E. 56th St. Chicago, 1L. 60637 Military Assistant for Training and Personnel Technology.

OUSD (R & E)

Room 3D129, The Pentagon
Weshington, DC 20301-3060

Dr. Ray Perez ARI (PERI-11) 5001 Eisenbower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22335 Dr. David N. Perkins Educational Technology Center 337 Guinan Library Appien Way Cambridge, MA 02138

Dr Steven Pinker
Department of Psychology
E10-018
M I T
Cambridge, MA 02139

Dr. Tjeerd Plomp fwente University of Technology Department of Education P O Box 217 7500 AE ENSCHEDE THE NETHERLANDS

Dr. Martha Polson Department of Psychology Campus Box 346 University of Colorado Boulder, CO 80309 Dr Peter Polson University of Colorado Department of Psychology Boulder, CO 80309

Dr Micheel I Posner
Department of Neurology
Washington University
Medical School
St Louis, MO 63110

Dr Joseph Psotka ATTN PERI-IC Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Ave Alexandria, VA 22333

Dr. Mark D. Reckase ACT P. O. Bos. 168 Iowa City. IA 52243

Dr. Lynne Reder
Department of Psychology
Carnegie-Mellon University
Scheniey Park
Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Dr. Wesley Regian AFHRL/MOD Brooks AFB, TX 78235 Dr. Fred Reif Physics Department University of California Berkeley, CA 94720 Dr. Lauren Resnick Learning R. & D. Center University of Pittsburgh 3939 O. Mara Street Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Dr Gil Ricard
Mail Stop CO4-14
Grumman Aerospace Corp
Bethpage, NY 11714

Mark Richer 1041 Lake Street San Francisco, CA 94116 Dr Linda G Roberts
Science Education and
Transportation Program
Coffice of Technology Assessment
Congress of the United States
Washington, DC 20510

Dr Andrew M Rose
American institutes
for Research
1055 Thomas Jefferson St.
Washington, DC 20007

Dr. David Rumelhart Center for Human Information Processing Univ. of California La Jolla, CA 92093

Dr James F Sanford
Department of Psychology
George Mason University
4400 University Drive
Fairfax. VA 22030

Dr Walter Schneider Learning R&D Center University of Pittsburgh 3939 O'Hera Street Pittsburgh, PA 15280 Dr. Alan H. Schoenfeld University of California Department of Education Berkeley, CA 94720 Dr Janet Schoffield Learning R&D Center University of Pittsburgh Pittsburgh, PA 15260 Naren A Schriver
Department of English
Carnegie-Mellon University
Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Dr. Marc Sebrechts
Department of Psychology
Wesleyan University
Middletown CT 06475

Dr Judith Segal
OERI
555 New Jersey Ave NW
Washington, DC 20208

Dr Colleen M Seifert Intelligent Systems Group Institute for

institute for Cognitive Science (C-015) UCSD La Joila CA 92093

Dr. Ramsay W. Seiden Assessment Center (CSSO Suite 379 400 N. Capitol, NW Washington, DC 20001

Dr Sylvin A. S Shafto
Department of
Computer Science
Fewson State University
Tetron. MD 21204

Dr Ben Shneiderman Dept of Camputer Science University of Maryland Callege Park, MD 20742

Dr. Lee Skulmen Stemford University 1040 Cethcert Way Stemford, CA 94305 Dr Rendell Shumaker Naval Research Laboratory Code 7510 4555 Overlook Avenue S W Washington, DC 20375-5000

Dr. Velerie Shute Afhri/Moe Brooks Afb. TX 78235 Dr Robert S Siegler Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Psychology Schenley Park Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Dr Zita M Simutis
Instructional Technology
Systems Area
ARI
5001 Elsenbower Avenue
Alexandria, VA 22333

Menpower Research and Advisory Services Smithsonian Institution 601 Morth Pitt Street Dr Derek Sleemen Dept of Computing Science King's College Old Aberdeen A89 2UB

UNITED KINGDOM

Dr Richard E Snow Department of Paychology Stanford University Stanford . CA 94306

•

Dr Elliot Soloway Yale University Computer Science Department P O Box 2158 New Haven, CT 06520

Dr Kathryn T Spoehr Brown University Department of Psychology Providence. RI 02912 James J Staszewski Research Associate Carnegie-Mellon University Department of Psychology Schenley Park Pittsburgh, PA 15213

Department of Paychology Yale University Box 11A. Yale Station New Haven, CT 06520 Dr. Albert Stevens

Bolt Beranek & Newman Inc

10 Moulton St

MA 02238

Dr. Paul J. Sticha Senior Staff Scientist Training Research Division Humbro 1100 S. Washington Alexandria, VA 22314

Dr. Thomas Sticht Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152-6800

Dr. John Tengney AFOSR/NL Bolling AFB, DC 20332

Dr Kikumi Tatsuoka CERL 252 Engineering Research

Urbana, 1L 61601

Leboratory

Dr Robert P Taylor Teachers College Columbia University New York, NY 10027 Dr. Perry W Thorndyke FMC Corporation Central Engineering Labs 1185 Coleman Avenue, Box 580 Santa Clara, CA 95052

Dr. Sharon Tkacz Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA. 22333 Dr Douglas Towne
Behavioral Technology Labs
1845 S. Elena Ave
Redondo Beach, CA 90277

Dr. Paul Twohig Army Research Institute 5001 Eisenhower Avenue Alexandria, VA 22333 Dr Kurt Van Lehn Department of Psychology Carnegie-Mellon Universily Scheniey Park Pittsburgh. PA 15213

Dr. Jerry Vogt Navy Personnel R&D Center Code 51 Sen Diego, CA 92152-6800 Dr Beth Warren Bolt Beranek & Newman, Inc 50 Moulton Street Cambridge, MA 02136 Dr Berbers White Bolt Bersnek & Newman Inc 10 Moulton Street Cembridge, MA 02236 Sy. Never of processing conversing for electricate processing processing resistant decimants personal processing for

LCDR Cory deGroot Whitehead Chief of Naval Operations OP-112G1 Washington, DC 20370-2000

Dr Meather Wild Naval Air Development Center Code 6021 Warminster, PA 16974-5000 Dr William Clancey Stanford University Knowledge Systems Laboratory 701 Welch Road, Bldg C Palo Alto, CA 94304 Dr. Michael Williams Intellicorp 1975 El Camino Real West Mountain View, CA 94040-2216 Dr. Robert A. Wisher U.S. Army Institute for the Behavioral and Social Science 5001 Eisenhower Avenue

Alexandria, VA 22333 Dr. Martin F. Wiskoff Navy Personnel R&D Center

San Diego. CA 92152-6800 Dr Dan Wolz AFHRL/MOE

Brooks AFB TX 78235

Dr. Wallace Wulfeck, Illi Navy Personnel R&D Center San Diego, CA 92152-6800

Dr. Joe Yesmtuke AFHRL/LRT Lowry AFB, CO 80230 Dr Joseph L Young Memory & Cognilive Processes

Frocesses
National Science Foundation
Washington, DC 20550

Dr Steven Zornetzer Office of Mavel Research Code 114 800 N Quincy St Arington, VA 22217-5000 THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY O

END JAN. 1988 DTIC